

Planck Collaboration Post-release Policy

V1: 17 May 2013

1. Background

With the release of Planck data to the public, it becomes possible for members of the Planck Collaboration to work on public Planck data with or without external collaborators. To the extent possible, Planck Collaboration members should not be placed at a disadvantage for work with public data compared to external scientists. At the same time, it is expected (and part of current Planck policy) that members of the Planck Collaboration will contribute actively and significantly to Planck's scientific goals, in a manner agreed by the Collaboration's management.

The goal of this post-release extension to the Planck policies is to specify the range of external work by Planck Collaboration members that is encouraged and acceptable, and the procedures for approval, tracking, and publication of such work that will be used by the Planck Collaboration to ensure that it does not cause conflicts within the Collaboration or compromise the scientific or operational goals of the collaboration.

This policy extension does not replace or supersede any existing Planck policies. All policies relating to proprietary (un-published) Planck data remain in force. This policy may evolve depending on circumstances.

2. Definitions

2.1 The Planck Programme

The ensemble of scientific work being pursued by the Planck Collaboration under the sponsorship and direction of the Planck Science Team is defined as 'the Planck Programme.' The Planck Programme is based on Projects that lead to published papers. Teams of Collaboration members are associated with Projects, as defined in the Planck online database. A set of planned Planck papers is defined by the Planck Science Team (ST) with the help of the Planck Editorial Board (EB). This policy applies to all scientific areas that overlap with the areas covered by the Planck Projects, and addresses both Working Practices and Publication of Work.

At the time this policy is issued (May 2013), the Planck Programme for the 2014 release is not fully established — both Projects and papers are being re(defined). In the interim, the Planck Programme is considered to include all CMB-related work (both temperature and polarization), all foreground polarization work, and all work currently in the Planck Intermediate Papers green and yellow categories.

2.2 External Work

External work is defined as work not in the Planck Programme.

It is recognized from the outset that there will be work which is undoubtedly external to the Planck Programme, but that there will be many cases where it is more difficult to decide and several factors will have to be weighed (see Section 3). The final arbiter in this respect is the Planck Science Team. To facilitate the definition, the Science Team expects the members of the Collaboration to act in a transparent and forthcoming manner, i.e. to seek advice in cases where any doubts exist. If a member acts without such advice and undertakes work or publications (see Section 2.3) which are later determined not to be external, then he/she will be subject to sanctions (see Section 4).

Two classes of work not in the Planck Programme can be specified without qualification:

- follow-up observations of sources in the PCCS1, PSZ1, ERCSC, ECC and ESZ.
- follow-up observations of diffuse foregrounds in the released maps. (*Cosmology-oriented component separation activities are not external, however.*)

Additional classes of work must be assessed by the Planck Science Team on a case-by-case basis, as multiple factors will have to be weighed (see Sect. 3). Examples include:

- scientific analysis of Planck public data alone or in combination with external data sets. Examples: CMB analysis in collaboration with other experiments or teams.
- foreground-related work which has an impact on cosmology-oriented component separation within the Collaboration.
- the provision of Planck-related scientific advice or consultation to individuals or groups not part of the Planck Collaboration, even if resulting publications are not signed by the Planck members themselves. Example: supervising/advising students or postdocs who are not members of the Planck Collaboration.

2.3 External Publications

External publications are publications outside the Planck Programme, including:

- papers or presentations of External Work
- invited or contributed reviews or summaries of published Planck results;
- papers on algorithms and methods developed within the Planck Collaboration and used to generate public Planck data;
- papers presenting scientific conclusions that differ from or are contrary to those published by the Planck Collaboration;

- papers describing results of analysis that build on work published in Planck papers to obtain further results.

3. Policy Extension

3.1 External Work

External work by Collaboration members will be approved as such if the work does not:

- compromise the nature and extent of the members' agreed contribution to the Planck Programme.

- conflict, compete, or overlap in a significant way with work in the Planck Programme.

To ensure that these conditions are met, and to provide a mechanism by which Collaboration members can verify that work contemplated satisfies those conditions, Planck Collaboration members contemplating external work must submit a "proposal" for external work, including a brief description of the work and a list of collaborators (both inside and outside Planck), by email to planck_publication_management@rssd.esa.int (with copy to planck_science_team@rssd.esa.int). The proposal will be put in an area of the Publication Mgt system visible to the Collaboration (For publications see Sect. 3.2). The relevant project teams/working groups and the PST will check these descriptions and identify any conflicts, and the PST will either approve the external work as external or suggest modifications that would bring it into compliance.

To the extent possible (depending on the policies of external collaborations and the nature of the work), it would be desirable to share the results of relevant external work with Planck collaborators, e.g., via wiki posts or presentations at CT meetings.

N.B.—The use for any purpose outside the Planck Programme of Planck data, methods, analyses, or results that have not yet been released publicly (e.g., comparison, cross-calibration, or combination with data from another experiment) by Planck Collaboration members who are also members of the other experiment) remains strictly prohibited unless an MOU covering such use is in place and approved by the PST.

3.2 Publication of work

External publications will be approved as such if they do not:

- make significant use of knowledge, methods, techniques, or capabilities developed by the Planck Collaboration and not yet publicly released. (Obviously, unpublished Planck data cannot be used.)

- conflict, compete, or overlap in a significant way with publications in the Planck Programme.
- make incorrect statements about Planck.
- purport to be Planck papers.

To ensure that these conditions are met, and to provide a mechanism by which Collaboration members can verify that publications contemplated would satisfy those conditions, Planck Collaboration members contemplating external publications must submit a description of anticipated external publications, including the subject and goals, what data (i.e., public Planck data, data from other experiments, etc.) or methods will be used, the anticipated schedule for completion, and the proposed authorship, by email to planck_publication_management@rssd.esa.int (with copy to planck_science_team@rssd.esa.int). The proposal will be put in an area of the Publication Mgt system visible to the Collaboration. The four criteria listed above must be addressed directly. The EB will evaluate the descriptions and recommend to the ST whether the requirements for external publications are satisfied, and if not, whether the paper would more properly be a Planck special or general paper. The EB may make recommendations on the author list as appropriate. Based on this evaluation and any other information available, and taking into account possible factors such as effects on the image of the Planck Collaboration and the visibility level of the publication, the ST will make the final determination of type and co-authors.

Planck papers (General or Special) will follow the same process of review and approval by the EB and ST as all papers in the Planck Programme.

External papers will either be submitted (via the External Work SVN) to the EB in final draft form for ``light'' review by the EB, or, in the case that they contain proprietary data, information, or results from other experiments or collaborations, in the form of a description of the final draft at a level that would permit evaluation by the EB and ST, but without any proprietary information. The goal of this review or evaluation is to verify compliance with the above criteria.

The ST may decide that a paper should be published as an external paper under the condition that it specifies clearly that it does not represent the views of the Planck Collaboration. Such a decision would depend on the extent to which the paper is perceived to affect the image of the Planck Collaboration.

This policy is not meant to preclude the publication of results or conclusions that disagree with those of the Planck Collaboration in the case of scientific differences; however, the publication of such papers must be approved and coordinated by the ST with full knowledge of the origin of the conflict and the methods that were used internal to

Planck to try to reconcile the differences.

4. Sanctions

Planck individuals or groups that do not comply with the policy will be subject to sanctions that may range from restrictions on data access to removal from the Planck Collaboration. If a paper subject to this process is published without approval from the ST, the normal sanction will be the removal from the Collaboration of the Planck members who have participated in it.

5. Conflict resolution process

If there is a significant conflict in the application of this policy, a resolution process will be initiated. A panel of four Planck Scientists will be charged with finding a resolution which is acceptable both to the Science Team and to the affected member(s) of the Planck Collaboration. Two members of the panel will be selected by the Science Team and two by the affected member(s). The panel will have two weeks to come to a resolution. If no acceptable resolution is found in this period, a second panel with different members will be convened and given two weeks to come to a resolution. If again no acceptable resolution is found, the affected member(s) will be asked to comply with the Science Team's position. If they do not, they will be removed from the Collaboration.